



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/454,774	12/03/1999	BERNARDUS CORNELIS DE BOER	99-0134-UNI	4222

201 7590 12/21/2004

UNILEVER INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY GROUP
700 SYLVAN AVENUE,
BLDG C2 SOUTH
ENGLEWOOD CLIFFS, NJ 07632-3100

EXAMINER

PADEN, CAROLYN A

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
1761	

DATE MAILED: 12/21/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

56

Office Action Summary**Application No.**

09/454,774

Applicant(s)

DE BOER ET AL.

Examiner

Carolyn A Paden

Art Unit

1761

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 15 September 2004.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-5, 7-17 and 20-23 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 20 and 21 is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-5, 7-17 and 22 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 23 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 6) ☐ Other: _____

The request filed on September 15, 2004 for a Continued Prosecution Application (CPA) under 37 CFR 1.53(d) based on parent Application No. 09/454774 is acceptable and a CPA has been established. An action on the CPA follows.

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1-5, 7-17 & 22 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Hallstrom in view of Joy of Cooking as further evidenced by Carotenoids and Kesharlal.

Hallstrom teaches a butter substitute that contains phytosterol that is made according to the recipe shown at column 13, lines 18-24. At column 10, lines 58-62, the product is then formulated into a margarine product, which was favorably compared with conventional margarine. Thus Hallstrom teaches the preparation of a butter substitute for the "do-it-

yourself" cook. Claim 1 appears to differ from Hallstrom in the recitation of the inclusion of carotene and lycopene in the product. Joy of Cooking discloses carrots in bunches where carrots are steamed or cooked, skinned, reheated and then served by pouring melted butter over the carrots (see page 296). Joy of Cooking does not teach that carrots contain carotene in a particular amount. Evidence for the amount of carotene in carrots is provided by Carotenoids, which shows that carrots contain 1 g of carotene from 1 kg of carrots. It would have been obvious to one having ordinary skill in the art that desired to provide a nutritional, home cooked vegetable, to butter the carrots of Joy of Cooking with the margarine of Hallstrom. In this case the margarine of Hallstrom would have been an obvious low-cost substitute for butter (column 1, lines 25-36). The phytosterol is in a different phase from the carotenes because the carotene is in the carrots and the phytosterol is in the butter substitute. Also one would expect the carotenoids to be present in chromoplasts or chloroplasts because they are utilized as naturally available in the carrots. It is appreciated that lycopene and beta-carotene are not suggested but carrots are known in the art to contain these compounds as evidenced by Kesharlal at column 7, lines 60-67. It is appreciated that the exact food

ingredients of claim 13 is not shown in Joy of Cooking but to comminute a cooked carrot in order to prepare baby food or in order to prepare a food product for someone who cannot chew is an obvious way to serve a food. Also carrots are well known in the art as a vegetable component in a main meal.

Applicant urges that a special format of carotenoids. This has been considered but is not persuasive because no difference is seen between the claimed product and that of the references. Applicant urges that the rejection employs hindsight. This is disagreed with. Alternatives to butter, like Hallstrom, are available and known in the art. To use the product of Hallstrom in a cooking recipe would be obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art.

Claims 20-21 are allowed.

Claim 23 is objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Carolyn A. Paden whose

Application/Control Number: 09/454,774
Art Unit: 1761

Page 5

telephone number is 703-308-3294. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday to Friday from 7 am to 3:30pm.

The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-305-7718.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-0661.

Carolyn Paden
CAROLYN PADEN 12-17-04
PRIMARY EXAMINER 1761